

Journal of medical ethics

Contents

Editorial

The 1980 Reith Lectures

Huntington's chorea

New editor, old policy

Focus

On the death of a baby
Robert and Peggy Stinson

Commentary 1
R B Zachary

Commentary 2
A G M Campbell and D J Cusine

Main articles

Medical experiments on human beings
Bernard Towers

Ethical aspects of plans to combat
Huntington's chorea
C J Brackenridge

Consultants rule OK? the changing pattern
of medical hierarchy
N F Coghill

28

3 Debate

4 Even dying must be edited: further
thoughts on Joan Robinson
4 *Stephen Curry, Arthur Zucker
and Joanne Trautman*

34

Response: *Bernard Towers*

36

5 Words

Mental illness
Roger Scruton

37

Case conference

Where's there's no will there's no way

39

Book reviews

42

Lectures and symposia

49

19 News and notes

50

Correspondence

51

24 Medical groups

52

In this issue:

**PREMATURE BABIES AND INTENSIVE CARE.... EXPERIMENTS ON
HUMAN BEINGS.... THE CONSULTANT'S CHANGING ROLE....
ETHICS AND HUNTINGTON'S CHOREA.... TV 'TRIUMPH' ATTACKED....**

Journal of medical ethics

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* has been established, with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *Journal* is published quarterly.

The *Journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

Editorial Board

EDITOR:

Raanan Gillon, BA (Philosophy), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

CONSULTING EDITORS:

A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

EDITORIAL BOARD:

R B Welbourn (Chairman), Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

K M Boyd, Research Fellow, Edinburgh Medical Group.

R D Catterall, Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital, London.

Sir John Donne, Chairman, SE Thames Regional Health Authority.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, University of Glasgow.

G R Dunstan, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

Michael F Green, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.

Gerard J Hughes SJ, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

Ian Kennedy, Faculty of Law, King's College, London.

Marshall Marinker, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester.

Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, University of Southampton.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, University of Cambridge.

Margaret Stacey, Professor of Sociology, University of Warwick.

Anthony Thorley, Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle-upon-Tyne.

Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

Edward Shotton, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

TECHNICAL EDITOR:

Dorothy Mitchell Smith, Edinburgh.

Contents

Editorial

The 1980 Reith Lectures 3

Huntington's chorea 4

New editor, old policy 4

Focus

On the death of a baby
Robert and Peggy Stinson 5

Commentary 1
R B Zachary 11

Commentary 2
A G M Campbell and D J Cusine 13

Main articles

Medical experiments on human beings
Bernard Towers 19

Ethical aspects of plans to combat
Huntington's chorea
C J Brackenridge 24

Consultants rule OK? the changing pattern
of medical hierarchy
N F Coghill 28

Debate

Even dying must be edited: further
thoughts on Jean Robinson
*Stephen Curry, Arthur Zucker
and Joanne Trautmann* 34

Response: *Bernard Towers* 36

Words

Mental illness
Roger Scruton 37

Case conference

Where's there's no will there's no way 39

Book reviews 42

Lectures and symposia 49

News and notes 50

Correspondence 51

Medical groups 52

Contents

NO 1 MARCH 1981

Editorial

The 1980 Reith Lectures

Huntington's chorea

New editor, old policy

Focus

On the death of a baby

Robert and Peggy Stinson

Commentary 1

R B Zachary

Commentary 2

A G M Campbell and D J Cusine

Main articles

Medical experiments on human beings

Bernard Towers

Ethical aspects of plans to combat

Huntington's chorea

C J Brackenridge

Consultants rule OK? the changing pattern of medical hierarchy

N F Coghill

Debate

Even dying must be edited: further thoughts on Jean Robinson

Stephen Curry, Arthur Zucker and Joanne Trautmann

Response: *Bernard Towers*

Words

Mental illness

Roger Scruton

Case conference

Where's there's no will there's no way

Roger Higgs

Book reviews

Lectures and symposia

News and notes

Correspondence

Medical groups

NO 2 JUNE 1981

Editorial

3 Ordinary and extraordinary means 55

Focus

4 The wrong doctors: selection or training at fault?

Alison Munro

59

Commentary *Bruce MacGillivray*

Main articles

11 Learning about death: a project report from the Edinburgh University Medical School

Ian E Thompson, C P Lowther, Derek Doyle,

13 *Jeremy Bird and Jane Turnbull* 62

Ethical aspects of clinical decision-making

I Kollemarten, C Strandberg, B M Thomsen et al 67

19 Students' attitudes to ethics in the medical school curriculum

Earl E Shelp, Michael L Russell and Nellie Grose

70

Debate

24 Extraordinary means and the sanctity of life

Helga Kuhse 74

28 Commentary *Gerard J Hughes SJ*

79

Response *Helga Kuhse*

81

Can fluids and electrolytes be 'extraordinary' treatment?

Carson Strong 83

34 The fragmented man

Margaret Blackwood 86

Words

Dignity and medical procedures

Alexander McCall Smith 88

The parliamentary scene

37 Medical responsibilities in the Third World

Tony Smith 91

Case conference

39 How do we teach medical ethics?

Roger Higgs 92

42 Book reviews

95

50 Thematic review of past issues

103

51 News and notes

110

51 Correspondence

111

52 Medical groups

112

NO 3 SEPTEMBER 1981**Editorial**

Severely handicapped infants

FocusEthical problems in the management of
some severely handicapped children*John Harris*Commentary 1 and reply *John Lorber*Commentary 2 *G E M Anscombe*Commentary 3 *D J Cusine***Main articles**The place of confinement – a question
of statistics or ethics?*L I Zander*Doctor-patient relationships in general
practice – a different model*Thomasine Kushner*

The right to life

Kenneth Boyd

The pregnant Jehovah's Witness

*N C Drew*Ethical aspects of plans to combat
Huntington's disease – a response*Michael HKottow*

The houseman and the dying patient

G P Adams and Marilyn Cook

'Section 47'

*J A Muir Gray***Words**

Rights

*Michael Lockwood***Report from America**Surrogate mothers: private right
or public wrong?*William J Winslade***Case conference**Venial sin – a case for specific
transmission of information?*Roger Higgs*

Book reviews

Correspondence

Lectures and symposia

News and notes

Medical groups

NO 4 DECEMBER 1981**Editorial**

115 Medical ethics and medical education 171

The 1980 Reith Lectures—some reactions

Agreements and disagreements

117 *Sir Douglas Black* 173

120 I'm still proud to be a doctor, Mr Kennedy

122 *Eric Wilkes* 177

123 Medical mismanagement or public vacillation?

P N Bamford 179

Mr Kennedy and consumerism

125 *Dame Elizabeth Ackroyd* 180

Should the public decide?

128 *Michael Thomas* 182

Unmasking or demythologising medicine?

132 *Ronald A Carson* 184

Consumerism in the doctor-patient relationship

137 *Stephen Little* 187

A medical student's response

140 *Alan Schamroth* 191The threat to political dissidents in
Kennedy's approach to mental illness142 *Anthony W Clare* 194146 Defining 'disease'—classification must be
distinguished from evaluation*P D Toon* 197

150 A response to the critics

Ian Kennedy 202**The parliamentary scene**

153 Struck off!

Tony Smith 212

Book reviews 213

155 Correspondence 215

158 Lectures and symposia 216

162 News and notes 218

165 Index 222

167

168 Medical groups 224